

# Global disparity bias in ophthalmology artificial intelligence applications

Luis Filipe Nakayama <sup>1</sup>, Ashley Kras,<sup>2</sup> Lucas Zago Ribeiro,<sup>1</sup> Fernando Korn Malerbi <sup>1</sup>, Luisa Salles Mendonça,<sup>1,3</sup> Leo Anthony Celi <sup>4,5</sup>, Caio Vinicius Saito Regatieri,<sup>1</sup> Nadia K Waheed<sup>3</sup>

**To cite:** Nakayama LF, Kras A, Ribeiro LZ, *et al.* Global disparity bias in ophthalmology artificial intelligence applications. *BMJ Health Care Inform* 2022;**29**:e100470. doi:10.1136/bmjhci-2021-100470

Received 11 August 2021  
Accepted 03 March 2022



© Author(s) (or their employer(s)) 2022. Re-use permitted under CC BY-NC. No commercial re-use. See rights and permissions. Published by BMJ.

<sup>1</sup>São Paulo Federal University, São Paulo, SP, Brazil

<sup>2</sup>Retinal Imaging Lab, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts, USA

<sup>3</sup>Tufts Medical Center, New England Eye Center, Boston, Massachusetts, USA

<sup>4</sup>Medicine, Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center, Boston, Massachusetts, USA

<sup>5</sup>Laboratory for Computational Physiology, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts, USA

## Correspondence to

Luis Filipe Nakayama;  
nakayama.luis@gmail.com

Machine learning (ML) is a branch of artificial intelligence (AI) that performs a classification, prediction and/or optimisation task. Similar to brain neurons, neural networks output a label after multiple information layers connection, resembling human thinking.<sup>1</sup>

AI is already influencing care in many areas, such as radiology, pathology, dermatology and ophthalmology. In ophthalmology, a variety of multimodal imaging examinations are fundamental in the screening, diagnosis and monitoring of diseases and provide data input for AI development.<sup>2</sup> Some applications, such as the IDx Technologies (Coralville, USA) which was approved by the Food and Drug Administration 3 years ago, are already used in clinical practice as a screening tool.<sup>2,3</sup> Surprisingly, algorithms can even predict gender, age and cardiovascular risk through retinal images.<sup>2,4,5</sup> AI may reduce subjectivity and interobserver disagreement in clinical practice.<sup>1</sup>

Especially in low-income (LIC) and low-to-medium-income countries (LMIC), preventable blindness causes such as diabetic retinopathy (DR) and age-related macular degeneration could be prevented with screening programmes, home monitoring systems or telemedicine. AI-based screening could systematise screening and improve eye care in remote areas.<sup>6</sup>

ML requires high-quality, well-labelled, representative and large datasets, but at present, ophthalmological ML-ready datasets are only available in a few countries. One hundred seventy-two countries do not have representation in training and validation cohorts.<sup>7</sup>

Although data from all world countries are a distant goal, equivalent representation of all continents, ethnicities and the maximum number of countries is desired to reduce ML bias. Demographic information and other social determinants of health

are typically not contained in these datasets, making it challenging to interrogate algorithms for bias.<sup>7,8</sup> High-quality data are also fundamental for environmental-specific algorithm validation, which is essential before AI implementation.

Available automated DR algorithm performance varies considerably in performance in the real world due to limited training data, including heterogeneity in disease presentations and suboptimal image quality.<sup>9</sup> In addition, diverse sociodemographic and ethnic representation are necessary if generalisability is a goal.<sup>8</sup>

In LICs and LMICs, there is a growing gap between the ophthalmologist workforce and the population size. Two-thirds of ophthalmologists live in only 17 countries and in those countries, most practice in the urban centres.<sup>10</sup> AI applications can expand access to eye care and may reduce preventable blindness, which is currently 80% of cases.

In addition to diversifying datasets to build AI technology in healthcare, we must invest in building capacity for health informatics and data science across countries. International collaboration between research groups should be incentivised to narrow disparities in AI research in order to reduce world blindness.

**Twitter** Leo Anthony Celi @MITCriticalData

**Contributors** All authors designed and cowrote the draft of the paper and critically reviewed and edited the final draft. LFN and AK took responsibility for article concept.

**Competing interests** None declared.

**Patient consent for publication** Not applicable.

**Ethics approval** UNIFESP Ethics Institutional Review Board number: CAAE 33842220.7.0000.5505 / n:0698/2020.

**Provenance and peer review** Not commissioned; externally peer reviewed.

**Open access** This is an open access article distributed in accordance with the Creative Commons Attribution Non Commercial (CC BY-NC 4.0) license, which permits others to distribute, remix, adapt, build upon this work non-commercially,



and license their derivative works on different terms, provided the original work is properly cited, appropriate credit is given, any changes made indicated, and the use is non-commercial. See: <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/>.

#### ORCID iDs

Luis Filipe Nakayama <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-6847-6748>

Fernando Korn Malerbi <http://orcid.org/0000-0002-6523-5172>

Leo Anthony Celi <http://orcid.org/0000-0001-6712-6626>

#### REFERENCES

- 1 He M, Li Z, Liu C, *et al*. Deployment of artificial intelligence in real-world practice: opportunity and challenge. *Asia Pac J Ophthalmol* 2020;9:299–307.
- 2 Kras A, Celi LA, Miller JB. Accelerating ophthalmic artificial intelligence research: the role of an open access data Repository. *Curr Opin Ophthalmol* 2020;31:337–50.
- 3 Md A, PT L, M B, *et al*. Pivotal trial of an autonomous AI-based diagnostic system for detection of diabetic retinopathy in primary care offices. *Yearbook of Paediatric Endocrinology* 2019.
- 4 Poplin R, Varadarajan AV, Blumer K, *et al*. Prediction of cardiovascular risk factors from retinal fundus Photographs via deep learning. *Nat Biomed Eng* 2018;2:158–64.
- 5 Korot E, Pontikos N, Liu X, *et al*. Predicting sex from retinal fundus Photographs using automated deep learning. *Sci Rep* 2021;11:10286.
- 6 Xie Y, Gunasekeran DV, Balaskas K, *et al*. Health economic and safety considerations for artificial intelligence applications in diabetic retinopathy screening. *Transl Vis Sci Technol* 2020;9:22.
- 7 Khan SM, Liu X, Nath S, *et al*. A global review of publicly available datasets for Ophthalmological imaging: barriers to access, usability, and generalisability. *Lancet Digit Health* 2021;3:e51–e66.
- 8 Mitchell WG, Dee EC, Celi LA. Generalisability through local validation: overcoming barriers due to data disparity in healthcare. *BMC Ophthalmol* 2021;21:228.
- 9 Lee AY, Yanagihara RT, Lee CS, *et al*. Multicenter, head-to-head, real-world validation study of seven automated artificial intelligence diabetic retinopathy screening systems. *Diabetes Care* 2021;44:1168–75.
- 10 Resnikoff S, Lansingh VC, Washburn L, *et al*. Estimated number of ophthalmologists worldwide (international Council of ophthalmology update): will we meet the needs? *Br J Ophthalmol* 2020;104:588–92.